

THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH School of Physics & Astronomy







Understanding cosmic reionization:

The production and escape of Lyman-continuum photons in high-redshift galaxies unveiled with VANDELS and JWST

Dr Ryan Anthony Begley

Prof. Ross McLure, Dr Fergus Cullen, Prof. Jim Dunlop

The Epoch of Reionization



"This phase transition marks the important point at which structure formation has impacted every baryon in the Universe." – D. Stark (2016)

The Epoch of Reionization



Challenges of un





-11

Challenges of understanding the EOR



The ionizing photon budget required to drive reionization is dominated by the emerging starforming galaxy populations at $z \gtrsim 5-6$,

+ a possible contribution from AGN, but only minor due to the declining population e.g., Aird et al. (2015), Kulkarni et al. (2019)

$$\dot{N}_{\rm ion} = f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC} \times \xi_{\rm ion} \times \rho_{\rm UV}$$

Challenges of understanding the EOR



The ionizing photon budget required to drive reionization is dominated by the emerging starforming galaxy populations at $z \gtrsim 5-6$,

+ a possible contribution from AGN, but only minor due to the declining population e.g., Aird et al. (2015), Kulkarni et al. (2019)

$$\dot{N}_{\rm ion} = f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC} \times \xi_{\rm ion} \times \rho_{\rm UV}$$

Governed by the population statistics, and galaxy stellar population and gas properties

The VANDELS Survey

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields



- Primarily targeting star-forming galaxies at 2.4 < z < 7.0 (N \simeq 1700/2100)
- 20—80 hours on-source per target
- R=600, across the observed wavelength range 0.48 $\mu m < \lambda < 1.0 \ \mu m$
- N≥13 band photometry (0.3 $\mu m < \lambda < 4.5 \mu m$) to compliment the spectra and obtain robust physical properties (stellar masses, dust attenuation etc..)

→ McLure et al. (2018), Pentericci et al. (2018), Garilli et al. (2021)

The VANDELS Survey

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields



The VANDELS Survey

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields





17/11/23

SOTU Seminar - Tata Institute of Fundamental Research

The VANDELS Survey – Key science results

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields

• A key goal for VANDELS was measuring properties of high-z SFGs including metallicity (Z_*) e.g., Cullen et al. (2019, 2020, 2021), Calabrò et al. (2021)



The VANDELS Survey – Key science results

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields

• A key goal for VANDELS was measuring properties of high-z SFGs including metallicity (Z_*) e.g., Cullen et al. (2019, 2020, 2021), Calabrò et al. (2021)



The VANDELS Survey – Key science results

An ESO VIMOS spectroscopic survey of the CANDELS UDS/CDFS fields

• A key goal for VANDELS was measuring properties of high-z SFGs including metallicity (Z_*) e.g., Cullen et al. (2019, 2020, 2021), Calabrò et al. (2021)

+ studies on the evolution of passive galaxies and quenching mechanisms (Carnall et al., Hamadouche et al.)





- → Begley et al. (2022), MNRAS, 513, 3510
- → Link to arXiv (2202.04088)



- → Begley et al. (2022), MNRAS, 513, 3510
- → Link to arXiv (2202.04088)
- We assemble a large sample of N=148 SFGs at $3.35 \le z_{\rm spec} \le 3.95$ from the VANDELS survey.
- By utilizing deep, publicly available VLT/VIMOS U—band imaging and highresolution HST/ACS *F606W*—band imaging, we measure the ionizing to non-ionizing flux ratio for our galaxy sample $\rightarrow R_{obs}$



• Robust photometric measurements on the carefully decontaminated sample of galaxies.



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}} \times R_{\rm int} \times 10^{0.4 A_{\rm UV}}$

Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}} \times \mathbf{R}_{\rm int} \times 10^{0.4A_{\rm UV}}$

→ R_{int} is estimated from a fiducial SED model Cullen et al. (2019) showed that a $\simeq 0.07 Z_{\odot}$ BPASSv2.2 model is consistent with VANDELS SFGs at $z \simeq 3.0-5.0$



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}} \times R_{\rm int} \times \mathbf{10}^{\mathbf{0.4}A_{\rm UV}}$

- → R_{int} is estimated from a fiducial SED model Cullen et al. (2019) showed that a $\simeq 0.07 Z_{\odot}$ BPASSv2.2 model is consistent with VANDELS SFGs at $z \simeq 3.0-5.0$
- → A_{UV} is calculated on an individual galaxy-by-galaxy basis using the UV spectral slope (β_{obs})
 + an assumed dust attenuation law e.g., Calzetti et al. (2000)



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times \underbrace{e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}}}_{=\!=\!=\!=\!=\!=\!=\!=\!=\!} \times R_{\rm int} \times 10^{0.4A_{\rm UV}}$

- → $e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{HI}}$ which parameterises the optical depth of the IGM+CGM, has *largest influence* on the derived f_{esc} due to its large stochasticity
- → To overcome this challenge, we generate a large number of representative transmission sightlines e.g., Inoue et al. (2014), Steidel et al. (2018)



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times \underbrace{\boldsymbol{e}^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}}}_{\boldsymbol{R}_{\rm int}} \times R_{\rm int} \times 10^{0.4A_{\rm UV}}$

- → $e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{HI}}$ which parameterises the optical depth of the IGM+CGM, has *largest influence* on the derived f_{esc} due to its large stochasticity
- → To overcome this challenge, we generate a large number of representative transmission sightlines e.g., Inoue et al. (2014), Steidel et al. (2018)

→ This allows a more rigorous *statistical* approach in our model



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

To compare with R_{obs} we construct a realistic empirically motivated model governed by the equation:

 $R_{\rm obs} = f_{\rm esc} \times e^{-\tau_{\lambda}^{\rm HI}} \times R_{\rm int} \times 10^{0.4 A_{\rm UV}}$

→ Now generate a large N of model R_{obs} distribution realisations over a grid of $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$

Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

 \rightarrow Now generate a large N of *model* " R_{obs} " distribution realisations over a grid of $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$



Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

 \rightarrow Now generate a large N of *model* " R_{obs} " distribution realisations over a grid of $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$



SOTU Seminar - Tata Institute of Fundamental Research

Extracting f_{esc} constraints from the R_{obs} distribution:

→ Perform a statistical comparison to the observed R_{obs} distribution; 1) Binned maximum \mathcal{L} 2) Bayesian inference



Comparing our constraints with existing literature:

- → Here, we have established a $\gtrsim 3.5\sigma \langle f_{esc} \rangle$ constraint for VANDELS SFGs from ground-based *U*-band photometry *For the time first at this redshift*
- → Excellent agreement with deep *spectroscopic* results e.g., Pahl et al. (2021), Steidel et al. (2018), Marchi et al. (2017)
- → Massive improvement over *photometric* constraints that typically only provide upper limits on $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$ based on stacking



Comparing our constraints with existing literature:

→ Here, we have established a $\gtrsim 3.5\sigma \langle f_{esc} \rangle$ constraint for VANDELS SFGs from ground-based U-band photometry



What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

 \rightarrow A number of other physical properties have been investigated for their connection to LyC and $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$

 $Ly\alpha$ has been particularly promising ...

e.g., – observationally from local LCEs and at $z\simeq3$ with KLCS

- simulations: Dijkstra et al. (2016), Maji et al. (2022)
- indirectly from FUV spectra

Reddy et al. (2016), Verhamme et al (2017), Gazagnes et al. (2020) Kimm & Cen (2019), Saldana-Lopez et al. (2022) **+** *more*



What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

 \rightarrow A number of other physical properties have been investigated for their connection to LyC and $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$

 $Ly\alpha$ has been particularly promising ...

Motivated by this, we split our sample in two based on their Ly α equivalent width and estimate $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$ as before:

Upper W_{λ} (**Ly** α) : $\langle f_{\rm esc} \rangle = 0.12^{+0.06}_{-0.04}$

Lower $W_{\lambda}(Ly\alpha)$: $\langle f_{esc} \rangle = 0.02 \pm 0.02$



What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

 \rightarrow A number of other physical properties have been investigated for their connection to LyC and $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$

Other likely indirect travers include the *dust* content (traced by β_{obs}) and *stellar mass* (M_*)

e.g., both physical properties have been linked to the escape of Ly α ; Cullen et al. (2019), Du et al. (2020)

→ Investigating for any potential dependence on the *intrinsic UV luminosity* is also highly relevant for EOR studies.



What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

 \rightarrow A number of other physical properties have been investigated for their connection to LyC and $\langle f_{esc} \rangle$

Other likely indirect travers include the *dust* content (traced by β_{obs}) and *stellar mass* (M_*)

e.g., both physical properties have been linked to the escape of Ly α ; Cullen et al. (2019), Du et al. (2020)

→ Investigating for any potential dependence on the *intrinsic UV luminosity* is also highly relevant for EOR studies.

Pahl et al. (2022)



17/11/23

The VANDELS Survey: the average LyC f_{esc} of SFGs at $z \simeq 3.5$

What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

To summarise Part I ...

- ✓ We have established a $\gtrsim 3.5\sigma \langle f_{esc} \rangle$ constraint for VANDELS SFGs from ground-based *U*-band photometry, combining a carefully selected sample free from L.O.S. contamination and an empirically motivated model.
- ✓ After splitting the sample based on properties that show potential links with LyC escape, we find that the low-dust, UV faint population of galaxies common at z > 6 are likely to display $\langle f_{esc} \rangle \gtrsim 0.1$, the threshold often quoted as necessary to drive reionization.



Begley et al. (2022) # 2202.04088 What else can we learn about the galaxies that emit LyC?

To summarise Part I ...

- ✓ We have established a $\gtrsim 3.5\sigma \langle f_{\rm esc} \rangle$ constraint for VANDELS SFGs from ground-based *U*–band photometry, combining a carefully selected sample free from L.O.S. contamination and an empirically motivated model.
- After splitting the sample based on properties that show potential links with LyC escape, we find that the low-dust, UV faint population of galaxies common at z > 6 are likely to display $\langle f_{esc} \rangle \gtrsim 0.1$, the threshold often quoted as necessary to drive reionization.

Look out for future work in an Dawn (Copenhagen) – Edinburgh collaboration expanding this work for $g(f_{esc})$ Kreilgaard, Mason, Cullen, Begley et al. (in prep)

Begley et al. (2022) # 2202.04088



- → We still lack a comprehensive understanding of the physical mechanisms facilitating the escape of LyC
- → Motivated by the success of linking Ly α and LyC, we investigate the Ly α -LyC connection by assembling a sample of N≈130 SFGs from VANDELS in the redshift range $3.85 \le z_{spec} \le 4.95$



→ Begley et al. (2023), MNRAS, Accepted
→ Link to arXiv (2306.03916)

The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$:

- → VANDELS provides high SNR measurements of the observed Ly α flux as well as robust z_{spec}
- → Make use of the multi-wavelength photometry available for VANDELS to perform SED fitting
 - FAST++; Schreiber et al. (2018)
 - Bruzual & Charlot (2003) stellar population models
 - Chabrier (2003) IMF, $Z/Z_* = 0.2-0.4$, CSFH
- → Use the photometric-excess technique with the IRAC/3.6 μm photometry to measure the H α flux



The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$:

- → VANDELS provides high SNR measurements of the observed Ly α flux as well as robust z_{spec}
- → Make use of the multi-wavelength photometry available for VANDELS to perform SED fitting
 - FAST++; Schreiber et al. (2018)
 - Bruzual & Charlot (2003) stellar population models
 - Chabrier (2003) IMF, $Z/Z_* = 0.2-0.4$, CSFH
- → Use the photometric-excess technique with the IRAC/3.6 μm photometry to measure the H α flux
- $\therefore \text{ we have an estimate of the } intrinsic Ly\alpha \text{ flux}$ $f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha} = \frac{F_{\nu}^{obs}(Ly\alpha)}{F_{\nu}^{intr}(Ly\alpha)} = \frac{F_{\nu}^{obs}(Ly\alpha)}{8.7 \times F_{\nu}^{intr}(H\alpha)} \quad \text{Case-B+Wuyts et al. (2013)}$



The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}$:

- ✓ $W_{\lambda}(Ly\alpha) f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}$ relation consistent with that found at $z \simeq 0.3 - 2.6$ by Sobral et al. (2019)
- ✓ Extends to weak LAEs with W_{λ} (Ly α) ≤ 20 Å
- ✓ In good agreement with expected $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}(z)$ evolution presented Hayes et al. (2011)



The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}$:

- ✓ $W_{\lambda}(Ly\alpha) f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}$ relation consistent with that found at $z \simeq 0.3 - 2.6$ by Sobral et al. (2019)
- ✓ Extends to weak LAEs with $W_{\lambda}(Ly\alpha) \lesssim 20$ Å
- ✓ In good agreement with expected $f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}(z)$ evolution presented Hayes et al. (2011)

The lack of evolution in the $W_{\lambda}(Ly\alpha) - f_{esc}^{Ly\alpha}$ relation implies that the physical processes governing the production and escape of Ly α photons from low-metallicity, high ξ_{ion} galaxies do not vary significantly over $\simeq 11$ Gyr ($\approx 90\%$) of cosmic time



The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$:

 \rightarrow Now we want to investigate how $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$ correlates with $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$

To place constraints on $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$, we use the empirical relation established between low-ionization-state ISM line strength $(W_{\rm LIS})$ and $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ in LzLCS by Saldana-Lopez et al. (2022)



The Ly α escape fraction of VANDELS galaxies $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$:

 \rightarrow Now we want to investigate how $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$ correlates with $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$

To place constraints on $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$, we use the empirical relation established between low-ionization-state ISM line strength $(W_{\rm LIS})$ and $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ in LzLCS by Saldana-Lopez et al. (2022)

- → We construct VANDELS composite spectra in the restframe FUV to measure LIS ISM features :
 - Three equally-occupied bins split in $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$
 - "High" $f_{
 m esc}^{
 m Lylpha}$ composite with $f_{
 m esc}^{
 m Lylpha} \ge 0.2$
 - "Low" $f_{\rm esc}^{\,{
 m Ly}lpha}$ composite with $f_{\rm esc}^{\,{
 m Ly}lpha} < 0.2$









To summarise Part II ...

- ✓ We have demonstrated a clear correlation between $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$ and $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ for our sample of VANDELS SFGs a first at $z \simeq 4 5$.
- Supports evidence that the escape of both Lyα and LyC is primarily modulated by neutral gas geometry and dust.
 e.g., Chisholm et al. (2018), Gazagnes et al. (2020), Flury et al. (2022), Maji et al. (2022) + more
- ✓ Indicates LyC leakage indicators calibrated to trace these characteristics can be employed to better understand f_{esc}^{LyC} during the EOR.



Begley et al. (2023), MNRAS, *Accepted* arXiv # 2306.03916

44

To summarise Part II ...

- ✓ We have demonstrated a clear correlation between $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm Ly\alpha}$ and $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ for our sample of VANDELS SFGs a first at $z \simeq 4 5$.
- Supports evidence that the escape of both Lyα and LyC is primarily modulated by neutral gas geometry and dust.
 e.g., Chisholm et al. (2018), Gazagnes et al. (2020), Flury et al. (2022), Maji et al. (2022) + more
- ✓ Indicates LyC leakage indicators calibrated to trace these characteristics can be employed to better understand $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ during the EOR.



Begley et al. (2023), MNRAS, *Accepted* arXiv # 2306.03916

→ Future studies ... ?

• Incoming paper from a collaboration using zoom-in RHD simulations to predict the $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ of VANDELS spectra Gazagnes, Cullen, Mauerhofer, Begley et al. (2024, *in prep*)



- Incoming paper from a collaboration using zoom-in RHD simulations to predict the $f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ of VANDELS spectra Gazagnes, Cullen, Mauerhofer, Begley et al. (*in prep*)
- EXCELS survey (Co-I on JWST Cycle 2 programme incoming ~January, led by A. C. Carnall, F. Cullen)





Now back to the high-redshift frontier with JWST



+ Upcoming Cycle 3 proposals & much more in the future!



 Carnall, Begley et al. 2022
 Initial exploration of the ERO data from NIRSpec



- Carnall, Begley et al. 2022
 Initial exploration of the ERO data from NIRSpec
- $\circ \quad \mbox{McLeod / Donnan et al. 2023} \\ \mbox{UV luminosity functions, settling the} \\ \mbox{rapid vs gradual } \rho_{UV} \mbox{ decline debate} \\ \end{aligned}$



- Carnall, Begley et al. 2022
 Initial exploration of the ERO data from NIRSpec
- $\circ \quad \mbox{McLeod / Donnan et al. 2023} \\ \mbox{UV luminosity functions, settling the} \\ \mbox{rapid vs gradual } \rho_{UV} \mbox{ decline debate} \\ \end{aligned}$



- Carnall, Begley et al. 2022
 Initial exploration of the ERO data from NIRSpec
- McLeod / Donnan et al.-2023_
 UV luminosity functions, settling the rapid vs_gradual ρ_{UV} decline debate

Cullen et al. 2023
 Measure UV slope (β) at high-z
 → "dust-free" stellar populations



- Carnall, Begley et al. 2022 Initial exploration of the ERO data from NIRSpec
- $\circ \quad \mbox{McLeod / Donnan et al. 2023} \\ \mbox{UV luminosity functions, settling the} \\ \mbox{rapid vs gradual } \rho_{UV} \mbox{ decline debate} \\ \end{aligned}$
 - Cullen et al. 2023 Measure UV slope (β) at high-z → "dust-free" stellar populations → capable of driving reionization

 ξ_{ion} = ionizing photon production efficiency = $N(H^0)/L_{UV}$

 $\rightarrow f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ is only one **part of the picture**

The ionizing properties of SFGs of galaxies, and how this varies with different properties is also vital $\rightarrow \xi_{ion}$



Rinaldi et al. (2023)

 ξ_{ion} = ionizing photon production efficiency = $N(H^0)/L_{UV}$

- $\rightarrow f_{\rm esc}^{\rm LyC}$ is only one **part of the picture**
 - The ionizing properties of SFGs of galaxies, and how this varies with different properties is also vital $\rightarrow \xi_{ion}$
- → Strong [OIII]+H β emission is a smoking gun of **high** ξ_{ion}
- → Measure the [OIII]+H β equivalent width distribution from $z \simeq 2 8$ combining:
 - Literature results at $z \simeq 2 +$
 - VANDELS at $z \simeq 3.5 +$
 - **CEERS** Epoch1 at $z \simeq 7.5$







 $[OIII]+H\beta \rightarrow \xi_{ion}$ (Tang et al. 2019/2021)





The PRIMER Survey

PRIMER will provide ~400 sq arcmin of imaging in N=10 NIRCam + MIRI bands in the COSMOS & UDS fields

 \rightarrow Will increase numbers of [OIII]+H β measurements at $z \simeq 7.5$ by an order of magnitude





